

ANNEX 4

E-MAIL COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM RANCHERS AND CONSERVANCIES

From: John Otuoma [mailto:jmotuoma@yahoo.com]
Sent: Thursday, September 22, 2011 10:28 AM
To: director@laikipia.org
Cc: communications@laikipia.org; Tom Omenda
Subject: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line

The Executive Director

Laikipia Wildlife Forum

The Government of Kenya intends to purchase electricity from Ethiopia. Plans are underway to construct a high voltage power line (400 megawatts) to transfer the electricity from Ethiopia to a sub-station in Suswa in Kenya through Moyale, Marsabit, Matthews Range, Rumuruti, Aberdare ranges, Naivasha and Longonot. The power line will traverse sections of Laikipia and Samburu counties. In order to protect wildlife, the power will be transmitted as DC, which will be converted to AC at the Suswa sub-station before connecting it to the national grid. In recognition of this, the Kenya Electricity Transmission Company (KETRACO) has engaged Gamma Systems to carry out an environmental and social impact assessment of the power line.

During my visit to your office at the Nanyuki airstrip on Monday 19th September 2011, I informed you of the proposed power line and the need to have a consultative meeting with owners of conservancies / ranches that may be affected, particularly on issues related to the location of wildlife corridors, airstrips and disturbance to the natural landscape. Looking at the map that you gave me, the power line is likely to pass through the conservancies listed below:

Please assist us with contacts (email addresses and telephone numbers) of these conservancies / ranches to enable us invite them for a consultative meeting in Nanyuki.

List of conservancies likely to be traversed by the proposed Ethiopia-Kenya power line in Laikipia & Samburu counties

1. ADC Mutara
2. Bhora
3. Lombala
4. Ngorare
5. Ol Doinyo Lemboro
6. Ilmotiok Group Ranch
7. Koija Group Ranch
8. Oldonyiro Conservancy

- 9. Meibae Conservancy
- 10. Namunyak Conservancy

Kind regards,
John Otuoma
Environmental Consultant
GAMMA SYSTEMS

[FW: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line](#)

TO: 28 More28 recipients
CC: 4 recipients You + 3 More
BCC: recipients You
FROM: [Anthony King](#)
TO: [Ben Wandago](#) [Benson. Lengalen](#) [Daudi Sumba](#) [25 More...](#)
CC: jmotuoma@yahoo.com [Tom Omenda](#) [Josephat](#) [Sandra Obudo](#)

Dear All

The power line proposal looks to cut through the area from Mathews to Rumuruit – no doubt in the straightest or easiest line. We don't yet have the proposed route. However it may or will affect you. Please note the email below and contact John Otuoma directly for more information and the proposed meeting.

Kind regards,

Anthony

[Proposed Moyale - Rumuruti power line 3](#)

TO: You 1 recipients
CC: 1 recipient You 1 More
BCC: recipient You
FROM: [John Elias](#)
TO: jmotuoma@yahoo.com
CC: [Anthony King](#)

Dear Mr Otuoma

We have been informed by Anthony King at the Laikipia Wildlife Forum of the proposed power line from Moyale to Rumuruti. We would be interested to know its exact routing/alignment, elevation and design. We understand you are proposing a consultative meeting in Nanyuki, and we would like to be invited.

Regards

John Elias

Your Own Place in the African Wilderness

Andrew Harper Recommended 2011 + Travel & Leisure Global Vision Award 2010 + Amarula "Best Retreat in Africa" 2009 + Conde Nast Traveler "Hot Hotel" 2008

John Elias, Director
john.elias@ol-lentille.com
Tel: +254 20 204 7491
Mob: +254 720 389824
Regenesis Limited
PO Box 1512
Nanyuki 10400
Kenya

FW: Power line 1

1 recipients
CC: recipients You More
BCC: recipients You
FROM: [Sean](#)
TO: jmotuoma@yahoo.com

Dear John,

I have been passed on your e-mail about the proposed power line traversing Laikipia by Anthony King. The thought of a large power line cutting right through the middle of Kenyas second most important wildlife and conservation area is an ecological and financial disaster. I suggest you arrange a meeting for all those affected as soon as possible with the exact route of the power line and details then at least we know what we are dealing with.

Yours

Sean Outram

Sosian Ranch,
Samburumburu ltd
P.O.Box 6, Rumurutí 20321
0703707703
www.sosian.com

Re: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line

TO: 1 More 1 recipient
CC: recipients You More

BCC: recipientsYou
FROM:[José Kalpers](#)
TO:[John Otuoma](#)

Dear John,

Thank you for your email and NRT will make sure that someone attends this meeting.

One question: it sounds like this meeting will only focus on the Laikipia area. How about the Samburu and Marsabit districts? NRT works closely with all community conservancies involved in northern Kenya and we would be interested to learn more about the exact routes considered through those districts. Attached is a map of the region showing all the community conservancies we work with.

Looking forward to your feedback.

Kind regards,
José

Dr. José Kalpers
Chief Operations Officer

Northern Rangelands Trust
Private Bag, Isiolo, Kenya

Tel. : +254(0)64 31405
Mobile : +254(0)724 614046
Email : jose.kalpers@nrt-kenya.org
Website : www.nrt-kenya.org

[RE: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line](#)

TO: 1 More1 recipient
CC: recipientsYou More
BCC: recipientsYou
FROM:[tom lalampaa](#)
TO:'[John Otuoma](#)'

John,

In preparation of the proposed meeting would you kindly send us a map showing the proposed route and any documentation/literature relating to this power line. This will enable us to prepare adequately for this important meeting.

Many thanks.

Tom Lalampaa
Community Development Manager

Northern Rangelands Trust
Private Bag, Isiolo, Kenya
Mobile : +254-723 468 874
Skype : tom.lalampaa
Email : tom@nrt-kenya.org
Website : www.nrt-kenya.org

Re: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line 3

TO: You 1 recipients
CC: 31 recipients You 31 More
BCC: recipients You
FROM: [John Elias](#)
TO: [John Otuoma](#)
CC: [Anthony King](#) ['Ben Wandago'](#) ['Benson. Lengalen'](#) ['Daudi Sumba'](#) ['tom lalampaa'](#) 26
More...

Thank you, John. May I join with Tom Lalampaa in requesting a map of the proposed route and any other supporting project documents in advance of the meeting.

Your Own Place in the African Wilderness

Andrew Harper Recommended 2011 + Travel & Leisure Global Vision Award 2010 + Amarula "Best Retreat in Africa" 2009 + Conde Nast Traveler "Hot Hotel" 2008

John Elias, Director
john.elias@ol-lentille.com
Tel: +254 20 204 7491
Mob: +254 720 389824
Regenesis Limited
PO Box 1512
Nanyuki 10400
Kenya

Re: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line

TO: You 1 recipients
CC: 32 recipients You 32 More
BCC: recipients You
FROM: [Julia Francombe](#)
TO: [John Otuoma](#)
CC: [Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago](#) [Benson. Lengalen](#) [Daudi Sumba](#) [tom lalampaa](#) 27
More...

Dear John,

Please send maps and any other information regarding the power-line.

From the names of areas listed this line may be cutting through a critical elephant migration corridor - and impacting several tourist operations in which many people in the area are reliant.

Best wishes

Julia

Ol Malo Samburu Trust
julia@olmalo.org

Re: Contacts of conservancies traversed by power line

1 recipients

CC: recipients You More

BCC: recipients You

[Hide Details](#)

FROM: [Verity Williams](#)

TO: [John Otuoma](#)

Dear John,

Thanks for this, but unfortunately I will be unable to attend, as will be away.

I too should be very grateful if you could, please, send us all a map of the proposed route beforehand.

Also I should be grateful if you could send me the minutes of the meeting.

All the best,
Verity
SABUK

++++
Sabuk Lodge
P.O. Box 666
Nanyuki 10400
KENYA

veritykd@africaonline.co.ke
www.sabuklodge.com

FW: Friday 14th Oct meeting at Nanyuki. 1

1 recipients

CC: recipients You More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Gabriel Nyausi](#)

TO: jmotuoma@yahoo.com

Dear Otuoma,

Hope you get it as it bounced earlier.

Thanks.

Gabriel Nyausi

*Asst Community development Manager/
Regional coordinator Mathews Region*

Northern Rangelands Trust

Private Bag, Isiolo, Kenya

Mobile : +254-721 293 474/0733 293 474

Skype :

Email : gabriel.nyausi@nrt-kenya.org

Website : www.nrt-kenya.org

Re: Basic maps

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: recipientsYou More

BCC: recipientsYou

FROM:[John Elias](#)

TO:[Tom Omenda](#)

Thank you, Tom.

What is the venue for the Saturday meeting, please?

Re: Basic maps

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: 33 recipientsYou + 32 More

BCC: recipientsYou

FROM:[Aidan Hartley](#)

TO:[Tom Omenda](#)

CC:[Julia Francombe](#) [John Otuoma](#) [Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago](#) [Benson. Lengalen](#) 28

More...

Tom,

If adequate detailed maps of the power line route are not supplied ahead of a meeting in good time we may be wasting a long trip to attend in good faith -- because this information is a vital part of allowing interested parties to contribute to the EIA. If you do go ahead with this imminent meeting I propose that this can in no way be seen as

conclusive as you will need to schedule further gatherings when all stakeholders possess ALL the information needed for them to make studied decisions. Clearly this overhead power line will be of immense concern to all local parties and one's worry is it will have a major environmental impact that is potentially negative -- and given the conservation locations involved it could attract a level of international interest comparable to, one imagines, the controversial Serengeti highway.

Yours,

Aidan Hartley
Tango Maos Ltd

RE: Basic maps 1

TO: You + 2 More3 recipients

CC: 31 recipients You 31 More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Dr Max Graham](#)

TO: [Tom Omenda](#) [Julia Francombe](#) [John Otuoma](#)

CC: [Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago](#) [Benson Lengalen](#) [Daudi Sumba](#) [tom lalampaa](#) 26

More...

Dear Tom

Given the sensitive nature of the proposals concerned, I would like to kindly request that you give local stakeholders more time to go through the proposals and the maps, once these are ready, before calling this meeting. I note that the meeting is due to take place in 2 days time, on a Saturday, but a venue has yet to be confirmed. With all due respect, if you would like full participation from local stakeholders, it would be courteous if you could give us more notice than this.

I look forward to hearing from your response.

With many thanks

Max

Dr Max Graham | Founder & CEO

T: +254 (0) 20 800 2975 | M: +254 (0) 722 485 584

max@spaceforgiants.org |

www.spaceforgiants.org

Re: Basic maps

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: 33 recipientsYou + 32 More

BCC: recipientsYou

FROM:[euphorbiaLtd](#)

TO:[Aidan Hartley](#)

CC:[Tom Omenda](#) [Julia Francombe](#) [John Otuoma](#) [Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago](#) 28 More...

Dear Tom

From the maps provided it is impossible to make any informed comments whatsoever - they are at too large a scale. Would it be possible for your GIS expert to share the Shape files with an organisation that also has GIS capacity today? This would enable them to link it into their databases and perhaps speed up the process of production and assessment. Save the Elephants, Space for Giants, AWF, NRT and Mpala all have some GIS capacity and may be able to help - although time is now very short.

Kind regards

David

Ethiopia - Kenya power line 1

TO: 5 More5 recipients

CC: 34 recipientsYou + 33 More

BCC: recipientsYou

FROM:[Anthony King](#)

TO:'[Dr Max Graham](#)' tom@loisaba.com '[Sandra Obudo](#)' 2 More...

CC:'[Ben Wandago](#)' '[Benson. Lengalen](#)' '[Daudi Sumba](#)' '[tom lalampaa](#)' '[José Kalpers](#)' 29 More...

Dear All

There are three (maybe 4) primary considerations:

- 1) Environmental impact: there is probably a significant amount of knowledge already about this since these lines are fairly common, it will be a matter of fitting known impacts with the local context
- 2) Social impact: here things are trickier because different people see these kinds of things in different ways. Some like to see pristine wilderness, others like to see man's technology and engineering... includes perceptions of aesthetics

3) Economic impact: also tricky, looking at the local, national and international implications. Less dependence on fossil fuels, resolving the national power shortfall, opportunities for the less well off from compensation for crossing land, negative impacts on established and potential tourism enterprise, negative impacts on land values, loss of inward investment locally, etc etc will need to be weighed up. Again perceptions of aesthetics to consider.

4) Human health may also be a consideration

We have been through a similar process with the proposed Disease Free Zone. We worked on this professionally and involved people who knew what they were talking about. We were able to present an informed, professional and rational response, which has resulted in changing the national position with regard to Disease Free Zones. We did not fire off uninformed knee-jerk NIMBY reactions, and we must not do so with something of such national development magnitude as the proposed power line. I urge the tourism sector of Laikipia as a whole to work coherently through the tourism sub-committee (Chair is Tom Silvester) and officer (Sandra) to form a clear and single position; and through the conservation sub-committee (Chair is Max Graham) to similarly look at the implications and form a position.

The proposed meeting to receive views is premature, again we went through this with regards to the Disease Free Zone. The first meeting should be to simply present the proposed project to the fullest level of information and detail available to the concerned parties. Based on that, the affected parties will be able to consider the implications and present the ESIA consultant team and relevant Ministry with an informed response and importantly, a set of alternative options if the local impacts of the current route are found to be sufficiently negative.

Tom Omenda, I would request that you take this first meeting as a detailed presentation of the proposal so that work on this can begin on our side. It will also mean that a smaller group can attend who can feed back to the wider community.

Kind regards,

Anthony

Executive Director

Laikipia Wildlife Forum

[Re: Ethiopia - Kenya power line 1](#)

TO: 5 More5 recipients

CC: 31 recipients You + 30 More

BCC: recipients You

FROM:[Tom Omenda](#)
TO:[Anthony King](#) 'Dr Max Graham' tom@loisaba.com 2 More...
CC:[Ben Wandago](#) 'Benson. Lengalen' 'Daudi Sumba' 'tom lalampaa' 'José Kalpers' 26 More...

Dear Anthony,

Thank you for the initial thoughts. Anthony, can you suggest a venue for our meeting tomorrow? Could we meet at your offices in Nanyuki where we met the key people during the Disease Free Study?

Regards,

Regards,

Tom Omenda

[Out of Office Re: Meeting venue Ethiopia - Kenya power line](#)

1 recipients
CC: recipients You More
BCC: recipients You
FROM:[Anthony King](#)
TO:jmotuoma@yahoo.com

I am out of the office until Tuesday October 25th. For all matters please contact Dr Mordecai Ogada deputydirector@laikipia.org and Josephat Musyima community@laikipia.org and Rosemary Oyugi info@laikipia.org

Dr Anthony King
Executive Director
Laikipia Wildlife Forum
www.laikipia.org

[Meeting tomorrow](#)

TO: You 1 recipients
CC: 3 recipients You 3 More
BCC: recipients You
FROM:[Gemma Francis](#)
TO:jmotuoma@yahoo.com
CC:[Iain Douglas-Hamilton](#) [Festus Ihwagi](#) [Monica Dean](#)

Dear John,

I understand there is a meeting tomorrow for ranchers and interested parties that may be affected by the proposed Ethiopia - Kenya powerline in Laikipia County. Can you please provide Iain Douglas-Hamilton and Festus Ihwagi details of the meeting place and time in case a member of staff from Save the Elephants is also able to attend.

Many thanks,

Gemma

Gemma Francis

PA to Dr. Iain Douglas-Hamilton

Save the Elephants

P.O.Box 54667, Nairobi, 00200 Kenya

Tel: +254 20 891 673 / 890 597

Cell: +254 732 72 45 59

www.savetheelephants.org

Re: Meeting venue Ethiopia - Kenya power line 1

1 recipients

CC: recipients You More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Deputy Director \(LWF\)](#)

TO: [John Otuoma](#)

Dear All, I am in agreement with the views Anthony has expressed on this matter. Further to that, I do not see these preparations and notice as appropriate for a matter of this magnitude locally, nationally and regionally.
Regards, Mordecai

RE: Meeting venue Ethiopia - Kenya power line 2

TO: You + 6 More 7 recipients

CC: 29 recipients You 29 More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Sean](#)

TO: ['John Otuoma'](#) ['Anthony King'](#) ['Dr Max Graham'](#) [4 More...](#)

CC: ['Ben Wandago'](#) ['Benson. Lengalen'](#) ['Daudi Sumba'](#) ['tom lalampaa'](#) ['José Kalpers'](#) 24 More...

John,

Venue and location notice is far too late for us to change plans with only 16 hours warning. I have been away from my office until 7:00am this morning. This meeting has been rushed unnecessarily with very little meaningful information given to us. I will not

be able to attend the meeting but hope in the future you will be more organised to discuss this further.

Yours

Sean Outram

*Sosian Ranch,
Samburumburu ltd
P.O.Box 6, Rumuruti 20321
0703707703
www.sosian.com*

Re: Meeting venue Ethiopia - Kenya power line

TO: You + 5 More6 recipients

CC: 30 recipients You 30 More

BCC: recipients You

[Hide Details](#)

FROM: tom@loisaba.com

TO: [John Otuoma](#) [Anthony King](#) ['Dr Max Graham'](#) 3 More...

CC: ['Ben Wandago'](#) ['Benson. Lengalen'](#) ['Daudi Sumba'](#) ['tom lalampaa'](#) ['José Kalpers'](#) 25 More...

Dear John,

I am afraid I am unable to attend due to previous commitments

Out of Office AutoReply: Meeting tomorrow

1 recipients

CC: recipients You More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Monica Dean](#)

TO: [John Otuoma](#)

Jambo!

Thanks for your message.

I will be out of the office from September 28 through October 30, with only intermittent email access after September 28. Unless your message requires an urgent response, I may not be back in touch with you until I return to the office on October 31.

Please contact Shayla Givens with any TNC-related matters. She can be reached at sgivens@tnc.org or at 434-951-0539.

For non-business matters, please contact Robert Steckel at steckel@lynchburg.edu or at

434-946-7032.

Asante,
Monica

Ethiopia - Kenya power line meeting 15th Oct 2011 Nanyuki

TO: You + 35 More
36 recipients
CC: recipients
You More
BCC: recipients
You
FROM: [Anthony King](#)
TO: ['Sean'](#) ['John Otuoma'](#) ['Dr Max Graham'](#) [33 More...](#)

Dear All

We met with the consultants doing the ESIA for the 38m high HVDC power line from Ethiopia to Longonot/Suswa this morning in Nanyuki.

On behalf of LWF members I noted that the importance of this project for both national and regional needs is well recognized and supported.

However, I reported that the proposed route across Laikipia would not be workable because of the negative effect on the tourism sector which is based on selling a wilderness experience and setting. We discussed this matter in some detail, noting that significant investment had been made and was being made in the tourism sector in Laikipia, to the advantage of both the local and national economy, and that this was growing. Laikipia is now one of Kenya's prime tourism destinations and this was anticipated to continue to grow.

We discussed the possibility that the line be much more to the west from the start in northern Kenya. It was reported that the Ethiopian government's requirements there had pushed the line further to the east than was desired in Kenya, because it would have been desirable to have linked with the Turkana wind farm project line which enters Laikipia somewhere near Lonyiek and passes near Rumuruti before descending down into the rift.

We explored an alternative route which would cut across from somewhere south of Wamba, but north of Laikipia and then join the proposed route for the Turkana wind farm line. We also discussed the possibility of burying the wire.

We also discussed matters of wild animals and birds. It seems birds are most impacted by these things. Under the lines the bush can be left to grow up to 5m high, and any grazing or farming can continue under the lines. Apparently being DC means that the electromagnetic radiation is not the same as AC lines that we all live with and pass under regularly....

In short, however, it was clear the Laikipia's tourism needs to demonstrate it worth both locally and nationally. I was asked to submit a comprehensive report with quantifiable data to this end for Tuesday 25th October, including maps with tourism facilities,

alternative routes for the line and so on. This we must do if we don't want the line to run past the 7+ lodges the current proposal suggests.

I am away for the next 10 days, and also Sandra (LWF tourism officer) is also away at that time. However, we will send out a questionnaire to get up to date data to ALL Laikipia tourism to get a clear picture of its value locally and nationally. I am sure that everyone will be happy to send back their response and suggestions for an alternative route without delay.

All the best,

Anthony

Ethiopia/Kenya Power Line

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: 31 recipientsYou + 30 More

BCC: recipientsYou

FROM:[Rocky](#)

TO:[Anthony King](#)

CC:[Ben Wandago](#) [Benson. Lengalen](#) [Daudi Sumba](#) [tom lalampaa](#) [José Kalpers](#) 26
More...

Dear Anthony

Thank you for your email of October 15 2011 on the above subject.

I totally agree that the proposed route for the power line as per the map you enclosed, would be highly intrusive and would produce an extremely negative effect on tourism in an area that is rapidly becoming one of the top three tourism destinations of Kenya.

The main Area of Dispute

This would be between the Wamba turnoff at Donyo Sabachi through to Rumuruti.

The People Affected

Not only would many lodges and wildlife areas be affected but also affected would be the numerous tribal conservation areas that everyone has been striving so hard to create. The pastoral way of live in these areas is under severe threat due to the numerous droughts or recent years and the development of conservation and tourism could well be the way of saving these areas from complete destruction in the future. An ill thought out power line passing through them would surely be a highly unfair retrograde step in their development.

Radiation

An added problem is that of radiation. The power line will pass directly over numerous dwellings especially between D.Nyiro town and Rumuruti. Although a DC current is a great improvement on AC, research has shown that it does indeed produce a radiation effect which could open the consultants of this plan up to a large litigation threat in the future.

Suggested Route

I would suggest a route along the main road through Marsabit, Isiolo, Nanyuki, Nyahururu, Gilgil, Naivasha. This route would only increase the distance by approximately 10-12% and a large saving would be the easy access to the power line from the main road which is already a wilderness eyesore in itself, but which does not pass through any areas directly involved with tourism.

Conclusion

Tourism in Kenya is of prime economic importance and should be given every help possible in the planning of its future. I sincerely hope the planners of this project will think very seriously prior to going ahead with its development.

Regards

Colin Francombe

Re: Ethiopia/Kenya Power Line

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: 31 recipients You + 30 More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [James Christian](#)

TO: [Rocky](#)

CC: [Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago](#) [Benson. Lengalen](#) [Daudi Sumba](#) [tom lalampaa](#) 26

More...

Dear All,

I won't repeat all of the good ideas that Colin and everyone else has voiced about this issue but I would like to stress Colin's excellent point about access. I am not an engineer but surely it is easier to maintain powerlines along existing (and in the case of the marsabit road, excellent) roads (Marsabit, Isiolo, Nanyuki, Nyahururu, Gilgil, Naivasha).

Neither am I an economist but costs for initial construction and sending maintenance crews along squirrely roads through the heart of wild Laikipia would surely cost a great deal in lost efficiency. If this is the case I would imagine that besides the aesthetic and environmental issues, this would be the most effective criticism to put before the Kenyan people since while many people might not sympathize with the tourism sector all can understand the stupidity of wasted money.

Cheers, Jamie

Re: Ethiopia/Kenya Power Line

TO: 1 More1 recipient

CC: 31 recipients You + 30 More

BCC: recipients You

FROM: [Kuki Gallmann](#)

TO: [James Christian](#)

CC: [Rocky Anthony King](#) [Ben Wandago Benson](#) [Lengalen Daudi Sumba](#) 26 More...

Could not agree more and one wonders WHY that route was chosen?? In finding out the reasons l the winning strategy lays

Cheers

Kuki

Sent from my iPhone

